

CCT Meeting Minutes

Date: Thursday, 1st August, 2019

Present: Alan Walker (Chair, CCT), Malcom Elder (CCT), Malcolm Trott (CCT), Alan Milstead (CCT and Harbour); Lesley Prag (CCT & shop), David Prag (CCT and shop), Tony Leighton (CCT and Village Hall), Catriona Trott (CCT and Village Hall), Jennifer Lee (CCT, Planning Group and Shop), Alasdair Bennett (CCT, Planning Group and Chair EKREG), Ian Brodie (EKCC and MAKI), Jerry Barnes (EKREG), Rob Lee (EKREG)

Apologies: Rhona Elder (EKREG and Golf Club)

Venue/time: Carradale Golf Club 19:00

Agenda Item:

To discuss the establishment and approve the Terms of Reference of a sub-group of Carradale Community Trust to be constituted as East Kintyre Renewable Energy Group (EKREG) to advise about renewable energy developments impacting on East Kintyre and negotiate/maximize income to the East Kintyre community from community benefit schemes (CBS) allied to new and planned developments whilst exploring the opportunities for community shared ownership (CSO; aka 2019 Scottish Government Best Practice expectations), in conjunction with other local impacted community council groups where appropriate, in new and recently established developments

Minutes

- The meeting was Chaired by Alasdair Bennett (the proposed Chair of the new EKREG sub-group).
- Following round-the-table introductions AB and AW explained the backdrop to the establishment of the proposed group and the need to secure sustained income to deliver the legacy projects identified by the CCT Planning Group to service East Kintyre
- Changes to the Scottish Governments expectations of the interaction between windfarm/renewable energy developers and individual impacted communities (with wider geographic catchment than was formerly the case) were highlighted and discussed.
- The tie between Community Benefit Scheme (CBS) income from renewable energy developments and the Local Community Action Plan was emphasized along with the need for robustness in community consultation with regard the ongoing development of that exercise by the CCT Planning sub-group.
- A Renewable Energy Group had been constituted and members with specialist technical and business skills co-opted. (first meeting 18 July). The first actions of the group had been to endeavour to establish a dialogue with all new and planned/pipeline windfarm developers in the region with a view to negotiating/maximising CBS and exploring opportunities for community shared ownership (CSO)

- EKREG flagged that at least one new development, High Constellation (Cour extension) and possibly others in planning/scoping stages (incl. Sheirdrim and Narachan) were highlighted as causing the group sincere concern. High Constellation, in particular, as it will be clearly visible on the Northern Ridge from many parts of Carradale, and the surrounding district. Also it is owned by Blue Energy – a seemingly rather unscrupulous ‘holding company’ with a poor track record of community interaction and whom have serviced zero visible benefit to EK from their former development at Cour – and certainly not in keeping with 2019 Scottish Government guidelines. EKREG had drafted a strong objection to the HC development and this had been filed quickly by EKCC in advance of 2nd Aug deadline.
- EKREG had reviewed the current CBS income streams from existing windfarm developments and these were delivering to expectation ≈£56,000/year to EK Wind Farm Trust – the only non payer (since it went live in March 2017) was identified as Cour wind farm – the new owners of which had been approached by EKREG to establish a dialogue. All CBS schemes in place are top-sliced with 40% of the income taken by Argyll and Bute Council. This should not be the case under the new Scottish Government expectations
- The recent surge in planning applications for wind farm developments traversing the spine of Kintyre was highlighted - presumably reflecting the renewed and growing/predicted profitability of such developments (despite the removal of subsidies technical advances have cut many set up costs and infrastructure developments are reducing operating costs). Many of these will impact West Kintyre in particular and will be accessed from the A83
- Work on BaT3 starts next month (September) - will be visible from Carradale – the developer has been approached by EKREG to discuss CBS and the development affords a timely opportunity to begin to explore CSO (that could provide a significant income stream in addition to CBS). There followed some preliminary discussions on the models underpinning CSO and the various case studies that are available (like the development at Ardrishaig), and the likely need/expectation for legal agreement to underpin all arrangements.
- The need for a CCT website, up-to-date financial accounts and professional accounting practices, evidence of cross-community engagement/communication and consultation was emphasized to meet due diligence expectations allied to the realisation of CBS and CSO opportunities

AOB

- The need for the development of a CCT website was discussed. It was proposed and agreed that a new sub group attached to the Planning Group be constituted to be chaired by Rhona Elder and comprising DP/LP, TL, JLL ? and maybe others to achieve the objective and take advantage of DP/LPs template prior to their departure 1st Oct.
- TL indicated that there should be more community transparency on CCT sub group activities/achievements possibly using ‘The Antler’ to achieve this ?

- IB recommended raising concerns (via which body...EKCC ?) to the new Crossaig-Tarbert powerline that will be close to parts of, and accessed from, the B843 and the need for the contractors to keep roads free of hold ups and in prime condition
- JLL highlighted ongoing discussions between the Planning Group and MOWI in line with 'Best Practice' principles expected of renewable energy developers
- Communication within the CCT was discussed as it transpires that many have not been receiving information about sub-group activities. The issues were identified and this matter should now be resolved.

Actions/Decisions: Approval was unanimously consented for the establishment of EKREG from the 9 Trustees present at the meeting subject to some minor changes to the Terms of Reference and information transfer via AW to the 3 Trustees not in attendance. This led to a brief discussion over the CCT rules for decision making and the number of Trustees required to make a decision at meetings. No one appeared to know what constituted a quorum at CCT meetings, but there was the general view that all 12 Trustees were required to approve decisions. JB indicated this was highly unusual and impractical, usually 60-80% of the committee membership would be adjudged to constitute a quorate for decision-making purposes ?

JB was tasked with writing up and transferring a synopsis of the meeting, along with a revised Terms of Reference for the EKREG to AW for onward transfer to all CCT Trustees, and especially the 3 non attendees.

The meeting was closed by a sincere vote of thanks from the CCT to David and Leslie Prag for all their input into community projects, most recently the temporary shop, over many years. They will be sadly missed by all when they move out of the village/area.

